

# Moses's Final Reward or Punishment

Untimely, timely, or just in time - the death of Moses

Parsha Pinhas – July 8, 2020

20th Yahrzeit Golda Svea Rosen

Nathan Aaron Rosen



Moses's Final Reward or Punishment  
Untimely, timely,8, or just in time - the death of Moses  
Parsha Pinhas – July 8, 2020 – 20th Yahrzeit Golda Seva Rosen  
Nathan Aaron Rosen

Thank you to everyone who took the time out of their busy schedule to attend. I know that we are all somewhat tired of Zoom meetings, but this provided us a unique opportunity to share and engage with more people than normally would be if this was conducted on a regular Shabbat morning after davening at the Lincoln Square Synagogue as part of the Haskamah Minyan Parsha Class.

Thanks

- Mindy Schwartz Zolty for her invaluable work with me as a study partner for the last two months.
- Rabbi Doctor Moshe Sokolow for his decades of teaching us in the Haskamah Minyan parsha class and his sharing his teaching methodology and technique.
- Rabbi Chaim Brovender for opening Jewish learning to me starting with the year at Yeshivat HaMivtar and continuing with his weekly parsha, Gemorah, and Talmud Torah classes and the many classes at his creation, WebYeshiva.

Introduction

Thank you to each of you for coming and the opportunity for me to honor the memory of my mother, Golda Seva Rosen, bat Mordechai & Marie on her 20th yarezeit with this learning together. Thank you to Golda's sisters, Ruth & Harriet, her brother Rubin, her many nieces, & nephews, for attending, along with my father's relatives, my friends from Herrick Feinstein, my shul friends, and members of the Rabbi Sokolow Haskamah Minyan Class.

Golda was to me the pivotal person in my life, like what Moses was to the Jewish people for much of the Bible. So, it is only appropriate on the anniversary of her passing to learn about the circumstances and reasons for the passing of Moses. Additionally, we all think a little more about the timeliness of death given the past four months dealing with the Coronavirus and I especially think of this as Golda passed away only three years older than I am presently.

What we aren't going to talk about?

- What was Moses' sin – did he sin, what was it, did Aaron share in the sin, and was the punishment appropriate for the crime?
- Any discussion of reward and punishment in this world for our actions.

- Where precisely was Moses buried and why no one know exactly where that is.
- How many times must we be told the story that Moses does not get to go to the Promised Land? Do we learn something new from each separate recitation?

Everyone dies and we generally do not know when – some old, some young, some sick, some healthy, some with plenty of warning, and others suddenly. In each case the person, their family, their friends, and the community might have different views as to whether their time of death was untimely, timely or just at the right time. What we are not allowed to do is to blame the person for their death as a result of some perceived or unperceived sin.

So tonight, we are going to talk about is Moses' death and consider questions regarding the timing of his passing. To do that we will first start with a verse in this week's Torah reading, learn a little about it from traditional commentators, then ask the overarching question which we will try to answer from the various verses in Numbers and Deuteronomy. Then after learning some Talmud in Sotah and Chullin, along with another Rashi we will try to determine the untimeliness, timeliness, or just at the right time of Moses' death.

### Conclusion

So, was Moses' death untimely, timely or just at the right time? Now that we have learned some of the sources and commentaries, you be the judge.

Was it untimely as he appears to be in good mental and physical health, dies and is not buried West of the Jordan River, and had not completed his ultimate mission of leading the Jewish people into the land of Israel?

Was it was timely as he reached the ideal age of 120, both his brother and sister had already passed away, along with his entire generation, and he had completed his critical mission of leading the Jews out of the land of Egypt and bringing them through the dessert to Israel (at least where 2 ½ tribes will ultimately settle)?

And finally, was it was just at the right time as he passed the staff of leadership to the right leader for the task that the Jews were facing of conquering the land of Israel and making it into their home and installed confidence in the people that G-d was with them and that Joshua was G-d's chosen one for leading the people to conquer the land of Israel?

So, may we all live to 120 in both excellent physical and mental health and having achieved much in our lives and fulfilling the purposes for which we have been placed on this earth to accomplish. So, may we have length of days – a long life made up of many many days and have years of life – a life worth living filled with physical, mental and spiritual accomplishments making your life worth living.

## Numbers 27:12-13

The Lord said to Moses,  
Ascend these heights of  
Abarim and view the land  
that I have given to the  
Israelite people.

When you have seen it,  
you too shall be gathered  
to your kin, just as your  
brother Aaron was.

New JPS

וַיֹּאמֶר יְהוָה אֶל-מֹשֶׁה עֲלֶה  
אֶל-הָרֵי הָעֲבָרִים הַזֶּה וּרְאֵה  
אֶת-הָאָרֶץ אֲשֶׁר נָתַתִּי לְבְנֵי  
יִשְׂרָאֵל:

וּרְאִיתָהּ אַתָּה וְנֶאֱסַפְתָּ  
אֶל-עַמִּיךָ גַּם-אַתָּה כְּאִשְׁרֵי  
נֶאֱסַף אֶהְרֹן אָחִיךָ:

# Rashi on Numbers 27:12

רש"י

(יב) עלה אל הר העברים. למה נסמכה לכאן, כיון שאמר הקב"ה נתן נתן להם (לעיל פסוק ז) אמר אותי וזה המקום להנחיל, שמא הותרה הגזרה ואכנס לארץ. אמר לו הקב"ה גזרתי במקומה עומדת (תנחומא שם). דבר אחר, כיון שנכנס משה לנחלת בני גד ובני ראובן שמח ואמר כמדומה לי שהותר נדרי. משל למלך שגזר על בני שלם שלא יכנס לפתח פלטין שלו. נכנס לשער, והוא אחריו. לחור, והוא אחריו. לטרכלין, והוא אחריו. כיון שבא להכנס לקיטון אמר לו, בני, מכאן ואילך אתה חסור להכנס (ספרי שם): (יג) באשר נאסף אהרן אחיך. מכאן שנתאוו משה למיתתו של אהרן (ספרי קלו). דבר אחר חין אתה טוב ממנו (תנחומא שם). על אשר לא

RASHI ELUCIDATED

12. עלה אל הר העברים. – GO UP TO [THIS] MOUNTAIN OF ABARIM. Why is this passage put next to the passage about inheritance which appears here?<sup>1</sup> Since the Holy One, Blessed is He, said, „נתן תתן להם”<sup>2</sup> – “You shall surely give them [a possession of inheritance],”<sup>2</sup> אמר – [Moses] said to himself, אותי צוה המקום – “It is I whom the Omnipresent has commanded to apportion the inheritance of the land. שמא התרה הגזרה – Perhaps the decree has been rescinded ואכנס לארץ – and I will enter the land.” אמר לו הקדוש – “My decree stands in its place.”<sup>3</sup> The Holy One, Blessed is He, said,

## Ramban on Numbers 27:12

12. **View the land.** We thus see that “ascend these heights” was not given to Moses here as a commandment – otherwise he would have had to ascend immediately – but to let him know that he would have an opportunity to view the land. Having said, “Among these shall the land be apportioned”, He now informed Moses, “But it will not be apportioned by you. For you must go up the mountain and die there before the Israelites can leave Moab. You will not reach the land be can only view it.

# Abarbanel on Numbers 27:12

Hashem said to Moses go up to this mountain of Abarim and see the Land that I have given to the Children of Israel. You shall see it and you shall be gathered in. The question that stands out here is, according to the text, Moses did not die now, even though he was told to go up the mountain. His death is several months away at this time. ... Moses was not yet ready to die, he was still several months away from his death, so why was he told to go up the mountain?

...

After Moses was given the laws concerning the inheritance and the distribution of the Land according to the tribes and their families, Moses thought of himself "If Hashem told me ... Maybe that means that I will be allowed to enter the land after all" and that the decree against me was lifted. Therefore, God reiterated that the decreed remains in force, and he should climb up the mountain and see the Land from afar. ... There was a very important reason for Moses to realize that he will die soon because that gave him a high level of urgency to finish now with some unfinished odds and ends of the laws of the Torah that needed to be clarified.

The Ramban here asks, if this command to go up the mountain and see the Land was given now then how come Moses waited till the day of his death to go up on the mountain? The Ramban therefore answers that the intention of this command was not meant to be fulfilled immediately, rather it was meant to be fulfilled by Moses on the day of his death. ... Now, I do find the Ramban's answer problematic, because why would Hashem tell him now about his ascension upon the mountain on the day of his death when he still had the battle with Midian before him? What makes it even more strange is: why talk about what he will have to do on the day of his death when Moses still had so much to accomplish. ...

Now therefore, it is my opinion that the command here for Moses to ascend the mountain was not connected to his imminent death as the Ramban would have us believe. It was not even meant to be a command. Instead it was meant as a suggestion for him to go up and see as much as possible of the Land. As a matter of fact, it was with this in mind that Hashem advised Moses to go up as often as possible and to see as much as possible of the Land which he cherished so much. ... Hashem advised Moses to go up the mountain as often as possible and each time to view another piece of the Land.





# Mount Nebo & Mount Pisgah

Mount Nebo is an elevated ridge of the Avarim in Jordan, approximately 2,330 ft above sea level. The view from the summit provides a panorama view of the land and, to the north, a more limited one of the valley of the River Jordan. The West Bank city of Jericho is usually visible from the summit, as is Jerusalem on a very clear day. Wikipedia

Mount Pisgah - Some translators of the book of Deuteronomy translate Pisgah as a name of a mountain, usually referring to Mount Nebo. The region lies directly east of the Jordan River and just northeast of the Dead Sea. Mount Nebo is the highest among a handful of Pisgah summits; an arid cluster of hilltops on the western edge of the Trans-Jordanian Plateau. Wikipedia

# View from Mount Nebo



# Three possible ways to view Moses' death

Point of view	Untimely	Timely	Just in time
Moses			
Jewish people			
God			

## Numbers 20:12-13

But the Lord said to Moses and Aaron, Because you did not trust Me enough to affirm My sanctity in the sight of the Israelite people, therefore you shall **not lead** this congregation into the land that I have given them.

New JPS

וַיֹּאמֶר יְהוָה אֶל-מֹשֶׁה  
וְאֶל-אַהֲרֹן יַעֲזֹב לֹא-הֶאֱמַנְתֶּם  
בִּי לְהַקְדִּישְׁנִי לְעֵינֵי בְנֵי  
יִשְׂרָאֵל לָכֵן לֹא תְבִיאוּ  
אֶת-הַקְּהָל הַזֶּה אֶל-הָאָרֶץ  
אֲשֶׁר-נָתַתִּי לָהֶם:

## Deuteronomy 3:23-27

I pleaded with the Lord at that time, saying O Lord G-d, You who let Your servant see the first works of Your greatness and Your mighty hand, You whose powerful deeds no god in heaven or on earth can equal. Let me, I pray, cross over and see the good land on the other side of the Jordan, that good hill country, and the Lebanon. But the Lord was wrathful with me on your account and would not listen to me. The Lord said to me, Enough, Never speak to Me of this matter again. Go up to the summit of Pisgah and gaze about, to the west, the north, the south, and the east. Look at it well, for you shall not go across yonder Jordan.

New JPS, Kaplan, Fox, Alter, & Steinsaltz

וְאֶתְחַנֵּן אֶל־יְהוָה בְּעֵת הַהוּא לֵאמֹר:  
אֲדֹנָי יְהוִה אַתָּה הַחֲלוּת לְהִרְאוֹת אֶת־עַבְדְּךָ  
אֶת־גְּדֻלָּתְךָ וְאֶת־יָדְךָ הַחֲזָקָה אֲשֶׁר מִי־אֵל  
בַּשָּׁמַיִם וּבָאָרֶץ אֲשֶׁר־יַעֲשֶׂה כְּמַעֲשֵׂיךָ  
וּכְגִבּוֹרֹתֶיךָ:  
אָעֲבֹרָה־נָא וְאֶרְאֶה אֶת־הָאָרֶץ הַטּוֹבָה אֲשֶׁר  
בְּעֵבֶר הַיַּרְדֵּן הַהוּא הַטּוֹב הַזֶּה וְהַלְבִּינִי:  
וַיַּתְעֲבֹר יְהוָה בִּי לִמְעַנְכֶּם וְלֹא שָׁמַע אֵלַי  
וַיֹּאמֶר יְהוָה אֵלַי רַב־לְךָ אֶל־תּוֹסֵף דִּבֹּר אֵלַי  
עוֹד בַּדִּבָּר הַזֶּה:  
עָלֵהוּ רֹאשׁ הַפִּסְגָּה וְשֹׂא עֵינֶיךָ יָמָה וְצָפוֹנָה  
וְתִימָנָה וּמִזְרָחָה וִרְאֵה בְּעֵינֶיךָ כִּי־לֹא תַעֲבֹר  
אֶת־הַיַּרְדֵּן הַזֶּה:

## Deuteronomy 4:21-22

Now the Lord was angry with me on your account and swore that I should not cross the Jordan and enter the good land that the Lord your G-d is assigning you as a heritage.

For I must die in this land; I shall not cross the Jordan. But you will cross and take possession of that good land.

New JPS

וַיִּהְיֶה הַתְּאַנָּף־בִּי עַל־דְּבָרֵיכֶם  
וַיִּשָּׁבַע לְבַלְתִּי עֲבְרִי אֶת־הַיַּרְדֵּן  
וּלְבַלְתִּי־בֹא אֶל־הָאָרֶץ הַטּוֹבָה  
אֲשֶׁר יְהוָה אֱלֹהֶיךָ נָתַן לְךָ נַחֲלָה:

כִּי אֲנֹכִי מֵת בְּאֶרֶץ הַזֹּאת אִינֶנִּי  
עֹבֵר אֶת־הַיַּרְדֵּן וְאַתֶּם עֹבְרִים  
וִירְשֶׁתֶם אֶת־הָאָרֶץ הַטּוֹבָה הַזֹּאת:

## Deuteronomy 31:1-2

And Moses went and spoke  
these things to all Israel.

וַיֵּלֶךְ מֹשֶׁה וַיְדַבֵּר אֶת-הַדְּבָרִים  
הָאֵלֶּה אֶל-כָּל-יִשְׂרָאֵל:

He said to them: I am now  
one hundred and twenty  
years old, I can **no longer be  
active**. Moreover, the Lord  
has said to me: You shall not  
go across yonder Jordan.

וַיֹּאמֶר אֲלֵהֶם בֶּן-מֵאָה וְעֶשְׂרִים  
שָׁנָה אָנֹכִי הַיּוֹם לֹא-אוּכָל עוֹד  
לָצֵאת וּלְבֹא וַיהוָה אָמַר אֵלַי לֹא  
תַעֲבֹר אֶת-הַיַּרְדֵּן הַזֶּה:

New JPS

# Deuteronomy 32:48-52

**That very day** the Lord spoke to Moses;  
Ascend these heights of Abarim to Mount  
Nebo, which is in the land of Moab facing  
Jericho, and view the land of Canaan, which  
I am giving the Israelites as their holding.

You shall die on the mountain that you are  
about to ascend, and shall be gathered to  
your kin, as your brother Aaron died on  
Mount Hor and was gathered to his kin

....

You may view the land from a distance, but  
you shall not enter it – the land that I am  
giving to the Israelite people.

New JPS

וַיִּדְבֹר יְהוָה אֶל־מֹשֶׁה בְּעֶצֶם הַיּוֹם הַזֶּה לֵאמֹר:  
(מט) עֲלֶה אֶל־הָרֹקֵעַ בְּרִימ הַזֶּה הָרֹנְבוֹ אֲשֶׁר  
בְּאֶרֶץ מוֹאב אֲשֶׁר עַל־פְּנֵי יְרִיחוֹ וּרְאֵה אֶת־אֶרֶץ  
כְּנָעַן אֲשֶׁר אֲנִי נֹתֵן לְבְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל לְאֻתְתָּהּ:

(נ) וּמָת בְּהָרֹקֵעַ אֲשֶׁר אַתָּה עֹלֶה עָלֶיהָ וְהֶאֱסַף  
אֶל־עַמִּיךָ כְּאֲשֶׁר־מָת אֶהֱרֹן אֶחָיו בְּהָרֹקֵעַ  
וַיֶּאֱסַף אֶל־עַמּוּיוֹ:

...

(נב) כִּי מֵרֶגֶד תִּרְאֶה אֶת־הָאֶרֶץ וְשָׁמָּה לֹא  
תָבוֹא אֶל־הָאֶרֶץ אֲשֶׁר־אֲנִי נֹתֵן לְבְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל:



# Deuteronomy 34:1-5

Moses went up from the steppes of Moab to Mount Nebo, to the summit of Pisgah, opposite Jericho, and the Lord showed him the whole land: Gilead as far as Dan; all Naphtali; the land of Ephraim and Manasseh; the whole land of Judah as far as the Western Sea; the Negeb; and the Plain – the Valley of Jericho, the city of palm trees – as far as Zoar.

And the Lord said to him, This is the land of which I swore to Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, I will assign it to your offspring. I have let you see it with your own eyes, but you shall not cross there.

So Moses the servant of the Lord died there, in the land of Moab, at the command of the Lord.

New JPS

וַיַּעַל מֹשֶׁה מִמִּצְרַח מוֹאָב אֶל-הָר נֹבֹ רֹאשׁ הַפְּסָגָה  
אֲשֶׁר עַל-פְּנֵי יְרִיחוֹ וַיֵּרְאֵהוּ יְהוָה אֶת-כָּל-הָאָרֶץ  
אֶת-הַגִּלְעָד עַד-דֶּקֶן:

(ב) וְאֵת כָּל-נַפְתָּלִי וְאֶת-אֶרֶץ אֶפְרַיִם וּמְנַשֶּׁה וְאֵת  
כָּל-אֶרֶץ יְהוּדָה עַד הַיָּם הָאֲחֵרֹן:

(ג) וְאֶת-הַנֶּגֶב וְאֶת-הַכָּפָר בִּקְעַת יְרִיחוֹ עִיר הַתְּמָרִים  
עַד-צֹעַר:

(ד) וַיֹּאמֶר יְהוָה אֵלָיו זֹאת הָאָרֶץ אֲשֶׁר נִשְׁבַּעְתִּי  
לְאַבְרָהָם לְיִצְחָק וְלִיַּעֲקֹב לֵאמֹר לְזֶרְעִי אֶתְנַתְּנָהּ  
הָרְאִיתִיךָ בְּעֵינֶיךָ וְשָׂמָה לֹא תַעֲבֹר:

(ה) וַיָּמָת נָשָׁם מֹשֶׁה עַבְד־יְהוָה בְּאֶרֶץ מוֹאָב עַל-פִּי  
יְהוָה:

## Deuteronomy 34:7

And Moses was a  
hundred and twenty  
years old when he died;  
his eye was not dim, nor  
his natural force abated.

Old JPS

וּמֹשֶׁה בֶּן-מֵאָה  
וְעֶשְׂרִים שָׁנָה בָּמָוֶתוֹ  
לֹא-כָהָתָה עֵינָו  
וְלֹא-גָס לָחָה:

# Three possible ways to view Moses' death

Point of view	Untimely	Timely	Just in time
Moses			
Jewish people			
God			

## Sotah 14a

דַּרְשׁ רַבִּי שַׁמְלַאי: מִפְּנֵי מָה נִתְאַוָּה מֹשֶׁה  
רַבֵּינוּ לִיכָנֶס לְאֶרֶץ יִשְׂרָאֵל? וְכִי לֶאֱכֹל  
מִפְרִיָּהּ הוּא צָרִיךְ, אוֹ לְשִׁבּוֹעַ מְטוֹבָה הוּא  
צָרִיךְ? אֵלֶּא כֵךְ אָמַר מֹשֶׁה: הֲרַבָּה מִצְוֹת  
נִצְטָווּ יִשְׂרָאֵל וְאֵין מִתְקַיְּמִין אֶלָּא בְּאֶרֶץ  
יִשְׂרָאֵל, אֶכְנֶס אֲנִי לְאֶרֶץ כְּדֵי שֶׁיִּתְקַיְּמוּ  
כּוֹלֵן עַל יָדַי.

Rabbi Samlai taught: For what reason did Moses our teacher greatly desire to enter Eretz Yisrael? Did he need to eat of its produce, or did he need to satisfy himself from its goodness? Rather, this is what Moses said: Many mitzvot were commanded to the Jewish people, and some of them can be fulfilled only in Eretz Yisrael, so I will enter the land in order that they can all be fulfilled by me.

## Sotah 14a

אָמַר לוֹ הַקָּדוֹשׁ בְּרוּךְ הוּא: כָּלוּם אַתָּה  
מִבְקֵשׁ אֵלָּא לְקַבֵּל שָׂכָר, מֵעַלָּה אֲנִי עָלֶיךָ  
בְּאֵילוֹ עֲשִׂיתָם, שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר: "לִבְנֵי אַחֲלָק לֹא  
בְּרַבִּים וְאֶת עֲצוּמִים יַחֲלֹק שְׁלָל תַּחַת אֲשֶׁר  
הָעֵרָה לְמוֹת נַפְשׁוֹ וְאֶת פּוֹשְׁעִים נִמְנָה וְהוּא  
חָטָא רַבִּים נָשָׂא וּלְפֹשְׁעִים יִפְגִּיעַ."

The Holy One, Blessed be He, said to him: Do you seek to enter the land to perform these mitzvot for any reason other than to receive a reward?<sup>N</sup> I will ascribe you credit as if you had performed them and you will receive your reward, as it is stated: "Therefore will I divide him a portion among the great, and he shall divide the spoil with the mighty; because he bared his soul unto death, and was numbered with the transgressors; yet he bore the sin of many, and made intercession for the transgressors" (Isaiah 53:12).

## Moses point of view – death is untimely

- He is in good mental and physical health
- He desires to perform the special mitzvahs that can only be done in land of Israel
- He wants to be buried West of the Jordan River
- He has not yet completed his ultimate mission of leading the Jewish people into the land of Israel

## Sotah 13b

אָמַר רַבִּי שְׁמוּאֵל בַּר נַחֲמָנִי אָמַר רַבִּי  
יוֹנָתָן: לֵיצֵאת וּלְבֹא בְּדִבְרֵי תוֹרָה. מִלֵּמַד,  
שֶׁנִּסְתָּתְמוּ מִמֶּנּוּ שַׁעְרֵי חֲכָמָה.

Rabbi Shmuel bar Nahmani says that Rabbi Yonatan says: The verse means that he could no longer go out and come in with words of Torah. This teaches that the gates of wisdom were closed off to him.



## Sotah 13b

“לֹא אוֹכֵל עוֹד לֵצֵאת וּלְבוֹא” – מֵאִי  
“לֵצֵאת וּלְבוֹא”? אֵילִימָא “לֵצֵאת וּלְבוֹא”  
מִמֶּשׁ – וְהִכְתִּיב: “וּמֹשֶׁה בֶּן מֶאָה וְעֶשְׂרִים  
שָׁנָה בָּמוֹתָיו... לֹא נָס לַחֹה”, וְכִתְיִב: “וַיַּעַל  
מֹשֶׁה מֵעֵרְבַת מוֹאָב אֶל הָר נֹב”, וְתִנִּיא:  
שְׁתֵּים עָשָׂר מַעֲלוֹת הָיוּ שָׁם, וּפְסָעַן מֹשֶׁה  
בְּפִסְעָה אֶחָת!

The verse continues: “I can no longer go out and come in” (Deuteronomy 31:2). The Gemara asks: **What is the meaning of “go out and come in”? If we say it means literally that Moses was actually physically restricted from going out and coming in, but isn’t it written: “And Moses was a hundred and twenty years old when he died, his eye was not dim, nor his natural force abated” (Deuteronomy 34:7), indicating that he was at full physical strength? And it is written further: “And Moses went up from the plains of Moab to Mount Nebo” (Deuteronomy 34:1). And it is taught in a *baraita*: There were twelve steps<sup>N</sup> there to ascend the mountain, and Moses stepped over them all in one step, also indicating that he was at full physical strength.**



# Rashi on Deuteronomy 31:1

1. וַיֵּלֶךְ מֹשֶׁה וְגוֹמֵר – MOSES WENT, ETC.<sup>1</sup>

2. לֹא אוֹכֵל עוֹד לָצֵאת וּלְבֹא – I CAN NO LONGER GO OUT AND COME IN.<sup>2</sup> יָכוֹל שֶׁתִּשָּׁשׁ בָּחוֹ – One might be able to think that his strength had waned. תִּלְמֹד לִימָר – To teach us otherwise, the Torah says, אֵלָּא מִדּוּ – “His eye did not dim, and his moisture did not leave him.”<sup>3</sup> לֹא כִּהְתָּה עֵינִי וְלֹא נָס לִחֹה – “I can no [longer]”?<sup>4</sup> לֹא אוֹכֵל – But what, then, is meant by “I am not allowed,<sup>4</sup> שְׁנוּטָלָה מִמֶּנִּי הָרִשּׁוּת – for the authority has been taken away from me וְנִתְּנָה לַיהוֹשֻׁעַ – and given to Joshua.

□ לֹא אוֹכֵל עוֹד לָצֵאת – AND HASHEM HAS SAID TO ME. וְזֶה פֵּרוֹשׁ – This is an explanation. לֹא אוֹכֵל עוֹד לָצֵאת – because HASHEM has said to me.<sup>5</sup>

□ אֲנֹכִי הַיּוֹם – I AM [A HUNDRED AND TWENTY YEARS OLD] TODAY. הַיּוֹם מְלֵאוֹ יָמַי וְשָׁנֹתַי – Today my days and years have been filled.<sup>6</sup> בַּיּוֹם זֶה נִוְלַדְתִּי – On this day I was born, בַּיּוֹם זֶה אָמוּת – on this day I shall die.<sup>7</sup> דְּבַר אַחֵר – Alternatively, the verse means לָצֵאת וּלְבֹא – “to go out and come in” – in words of Torah. מִלְּמֹד – This teaches us שֶׁנִּסְתָּתְמוּ מִמֶּנּוּ מְסֻרוֹת וּמַעְיָנוֹת הַחֻכְמָה<sup>8</sup> – that the knowledge handed down and the wellsprings of wisdom had become closed to him.<sup>8</sup>

## People's point of view - timely

- All the other people of his generation had already died
- Both his brother and sister had died
- He got them out of Egypt and lead them through the dessert
- He got them safely to the entrance of the land of Israel
- He passed the mantle of leadership which God had ordained to lead them in the conquest of the land of Israel
- Reached the ideal age of 120
- Moses admits that he can no longer go out & come in

## Genesis 6:3

The LORD said, “My breath shall not abide in man forever, since he too is flesh; let the days allowed him be one hundred and twenty years.”

וַיֹּאמֶר יְהוָה לֹא-יָדוֹן  
רוּחִי בָּאָדָם לְעֹלָם  
בְּשַׁגְם הוּא בָּשָׂר וְהָיוּ  
יָמָיו מֵאָה וְעֶשְׂרִים  
שָׁנָה:

## Talmud - Chullin 139b

They asked Rav Mattana: From where in the Torah is the existence of Moses [Moshe] alluded to before his birth? He replied that the verse states: “For that he also [beshaggam] is flesh; therefore shall his days be one hundred and twenty years” (Genesis 6:3). The numerical value of beshaggam is the same as that of the Hebrew name Moshe, and it is known that Moses lived a total of 120 years.

## Sotah 13b

"וַיֹּאמֶר אֲלֵיהֶם בֶּן מֵאָה וְעֶשְׂרִים שָׁנָה  
אֲנִכִּי הַיּוֹם" – שָׁאִין תִּלְמוּד לומר "הַיּוֹם",  
הַיּוֹם מֵלֹאן יָמַי וּשְׁנוֹתַי, לְלַמֶּדְךָ, שֶׁהַקָּדוֹשׁ  
בְּרוּךְ הוּא מְשַׁלֵּם שְׁנוֹתֵיהֶם שֶׁל צַדִּיקִים  
מִיּוֹם לַיּוֹם וּמִחֹדֶשׁ לְחֹדֶשׁ, דְּכָתִיב: "אֵת  
מִסְפַּר יָמֶיךָ אֲמִלֵּא".

The verse relates what Moses said to the Jewish people at the end of his life: **"And he said to them: I am a hundred and twenty years old this day;** I can no longer go out and come in; and the Lord has said to me: You shall not go over this Jordan" (Deuteronomy 31:2). The wording is problematic, as there is **no** need for the verse to state the term **"this day."** Moses said it in order to indicate: **On this day, my days and years have been completed** to be precisely one hundred and twenty, in order to teach you that the Holy One, Blessed be He, completes the years of the righteous from day to day and from month to month, as it is written: **"The number of your days I will fill"** (Exodus 23:26), indicating that the righteous will live out their years fully.

## God – Just at the right time

- God had ordained that the upper limit for people to live in these generations were 120 years old
- God had already decreed that Moses' life would only be to 120
- Passed the staff of leadership to the right leader for the task that the Jews were facing of conquering the land of Israel and making it into their home

# Rabbi Lord Jonathan Sacks

A figure capable of leading slaves to freedom is not the same as one able to lead free human beings from a nomadic existence in the wilderness to the conquest and settlement of a land. These are different challenges, and they need different types of leadership. Indeed the whole biblical story of how a short journey took forty years teaches us just this truth. Great change does not take place overnight. It takes more than one generation - and therefore more than one type of leader. Moses could not become a Joshua, just as Joshua could not be another Moses.

## Rabbi Lord Jonathan Sacks

For each of us, there is a Jordan we will not cross, however long we live, however far we travel. "It is not for you to complete the task," said Rabbi Tarfon, "but neither are you free to disengage from it." But this is not inherently tragic. What we begin, others will complete - if we have taught them how.



# The Death of Moses (1907)

Providence Lithograph Company



Untimely, timely, or just in time - the death of Moses



20th Yahrzeit

Golda Svea Rosen



## Abarbanel

DON YITZCHAK ABARBANEL - Torah scholar, diplomat, financier, mystic and leader of his people, although living some 5 centuries ago, is particularly pertinent to the modern open society and global village in which we live, in a way that no other scholar seems to be. He is probably the last person to combine within his person 4 major and long existent Jewish traditions; philosopher, statesman, torah scholarship and cabbalist. Born in Lisbon, Portugal, in 1437, in 1483 he was forced to flee to Spain, where he re-established himself till the expulsion of Spanish Jewry in 1492. Ultimately, he made his way to Italy, where he lived in Naples and Venice till his death in 1508.

### Source

Abarbanel: Selected Commentaries on the Torah. Translated and Annotated by Rabbi Israel Lazar – available from [https://www.amazon.com/s?k=Abarbanel%3A+Selected+Commentaries+on+the+Torah&ref=nb\\_sb\\_noss](https://www.amazon.com/s?k=Abarbanel%3A+Selected+Commentaries+on+the+Torah&ref=nb_sb_noss)

### Verse 27:12

Hashem said to Moses go up to this mountain of Abarim and see the Land that I have given to the Children of Israel. You shall see it and you shall be gathered in. The question that stands out here is, according to the text, Moses did not die now, even though he was told to go up the mountain. His death is several months away at this time. ...Moses was not yet ready to die, he was still several months away from his death, so why was he told to go up the mountain?

...

After Moses was given the laws concerning the inheritance and the distribution of the Land according to the tribes and their families, Moses thought of himself "If Hashem told me ... Maybe that means that I will be allowed to enter the land after all and that the decree against me was lifted. Therefore, God reiterated that the decreed remains in force, and he should climb up the mountain and see the Land from afar. ... There was a very important reason for Moses to realize that he will die soon because that gave him a high level of urgency to finish now with some unfinished odds and ends of the laws of the Torah that needed to be clarified.

The Ramban here asks, if this command to go up the mountain and see the Land was given now then how come Moses waited till the day of his death to go up on the mountain? The Ramban therefore answers that the intention of this command was not meant to be fulfilled immediately, rather it was meant to be fulfilled by Moses on the day of his death. ...Now, I do find the Ramban's answer problematic, because why would Hashem tell him now about his ascension upon the mountain on the day of his death when he still had the battle with Midian before him? What makes it even more strange is: why talk about what he will have to do on the day of his death when Moses still had so much to accomplish. ...

Now therefore, it is my opinion that the command here for Moses to ascend the mountain was not connected to his imminent death as the Ramban would have us believe. It was not even meant to be a command. Instead it was meant as a suggestion for him to go up and see as much as possible of the Land. As a matter of fact, it was with this in mind that Hashem advised Moses to go up as often as possible and to see as much as possible of the Land which he cherished so much. ... Hashem advised Moses to go up the mountain as often as possible and each time to view another piece of the Land.

Moses' years were complete. ... He said, "Today my days and years are full, for today I was born and today I shall die."

Moses was now struck by a devastating feeling of dismay. He looked back at all the trials and tribulations that he had gone through in order to bring his flock, the Children of Israel, to the banks of the river Jordan. Yet he will not be able to complete his life's dream, for he would not be allowed to cross over this river to see his life's mission realized. He wanted very much to see his people settled on their Land in peace and tranquility. Moses was thinking to himself. "Here I took out the People from Egypt. I wandered with them through the desert for forty years for them to inherit the Land. I came to the banks of the Jordan and I did not merit to cross over and to see them inherit the Land. What a terrible disappointment. Someone else will now be allowed to finish the job that I began. Consider someone nurtures a fig tree from infancy till it begins to bear fruit. Justice dictated that the one who watched over the tree and who nurtured it should eat of it. And yet here, someone else will not come and pick the fruit from the tree that I planted and nurtured until now. It will be Joshua who will be given the opportunity to capture the Land from its present inhabitants. He will be given the title of the leader of Israel and he will conquer the Land, and it will be he who will receive the credit and not me." All this ran through Moses' mind as he faced imminent death.

God of course read his mind and decided to comfort him and to compensate he. He directed that the conquest of the Land and the division of the Land according to the tribes will be under Moses' direction. It was as if God was saying to Moses, "I already fulfilled your wish which was to see the land. What else did you want to accomplish by crossing over the Jordan and entering the Land? ... [lists 5 things]

"Now consider for one moment!" God said to Moses: "Would you be able to achieve all these entirely yourself? Surely it is impossible for one person to do all these things himself without help. It would therefore be imperative for you to appoint the people who would be in charge of carrying out these five things. Thus, even if these things were to be carried out by you yourself, you would not be doing it yourself. You would have to delegate to others to actually carry out the mission even though it would be done under your direction, and under your authority. Now therefore since these people would operate under your authority it is as if you yourself were doing it, and your

name will apply to all that they do. Now therefore, you may take pride in the knowledge that all these five missions are hereby given to you. ... Hopefully with this, your mind will be put to rest, and you will now feel as if you crossed over the Jordan and you did it all yourself. And hopefully **you will be comforted in the feeling that you had truly completed the job you had set out to accomplish.**

### Devarim 31:1

Moses continues by saying, "I am a hundred and twenty years old today, I can no longer go out and come in, and Hashem said to me, "You shall not cross this Jordan". What this seems to say is, that it was his advanced age and frail health – in addition to God's decree – that prevented him from entering the Land. If this is what Moses is saying then this contradicts a later statement in the final chapter of the Torah that says, "Moses was one hundred and twenty years old when he died, his eye had not dimmed, and his vigor had not diminished." This indicates that he was physically strong, and able to go in and out, and it was only God's decree that prevented him from crossing over the Jordan.

Moses wanted the people to make peace with the fact that he is – after all – an old man, and incapable of leading them into battle any longer.

The Ramban gives us two reasons for Moses' having said this. Firstly, because he is 120 years old, he is unable to lead them into battle. This is the meaning of the words, "I can no longer go out and come in." for even through at this time of his death the Torah testifies that his eyes did not fade, and his vigor did not diminish, nonetheless, his body and his limbs were those of an old man, and therefore unsuited for the rigors of battle. Secondly, Moses says, "Hashem said to me "you shall not cross this Jordan." This then is the way the Ramban explains it.

I however believe that – on the contrary – when Moses said, "I am 120 years old today" he did confirm that he was in good health, as the Torah testified on him, that his eyesight and his vigor were that of a young man. Yet Moses said in effect, that there is no use in fooling myself into thinking it will stay this indefinitely. "On account of my old age" Moses said, "there is no question that that the inevitable will come soon anyway, at this advanced age, weakness and frailty will set in, possibly in a sudden manner." This then is what Moses meant when he said, "I can no longer go out and come in" Meaning even if I am in good health at present, I cannot delude myself for the future. So, there is no contradiction here at all. So, while the Torah testifies to Moses' present condition Moses talks about the future, possibly the immediate future. Thus Moses tries to convince them that they should not grieve too much over his imminent death, and the loss of his leadership, because they would have no use from his leadership anyway, since he is too old.

I will say at the outset that it is my opinion that this vision that Moses saw of the Land was with his physical eyes, not just a prophetic vision of the mind... On the other hand, we are also compelled to say that it was not an ordinary sight, as one would normally see something with his eyes. The reason we say this is because, even though the Torah testifies on Moses that "his eyesight did not dim", yet even for someone with perfect vision as that which Moses had, it would be impossible for him to see all that which Moses saw from such a distance. ... We therefore must conclude that either one of two things happened.

Moses before his death, not only did he have good eyesight, but that God multiplied the power of his eyesight many times over what would be considered normal eyesight. So, he was able to actually focus in and see every parcel of land in front of his eye as if he was walking through it. Such a sighting by Moses could certainly have given Moses a degree of satisfaction close to that of having actually been there.

I already have written previously – based on Divine vision I had – that prophetic revelations according to the Torah, can come in four different ways, and it is based on the individual who is the recipient of the vision.

1 – It may be revelation in the mind, as such that everything in the vision will be clearly defined with a clear logic without the need to interpret or decipher what he saw. It is a clear message from God...

2 – The visionary sees a definite message, but it is in the form of a parable or a riddle, or maybe some symbolic gesture, etc, the recipient will have to decipher the riddle, and interpret the parable, and clarify the symbolic gesture, in order to understand the message.

3 – A third possibility is that the prophetic vision will be simultaneously reveal itself in the mind and in the imagination.

4 – This type of prophecy is a practical one in which the prophet sees the vision take place in front of his eyes, and he will hear the actual sounds. These are actual practical scenes that are taking place in front of the eyes of the prophet and not just in his mind or in his imagination.

From all this we can get an understanding of the way Moses saw the Land with his eyes. This was an actual eyewitness that Moses witnessed as if it all was right in front of his eyes. And not just a general look at the landscape, but a detailed look at every parcel of land including all the rich produce thereof. All the details of the entire Land were as if in front of Moses' eyes. ... Furthermore, not only did he see every piece of land in detail but as he looked at each piece of land he saw the entire future history of that land unfold in front of his eyes right up until the very last day. This therefore was an extremely satisfying experience for Moses, not just a conciliatory gesture towards Moses, but a gesture that would definitely assuage Moses' feelings of disappointment at

not being able to enter the Land. With this Hashem really fulfilled Moses' wish to see the Land, and it allowed Moses to die in piece.

...

Moses had a thrilling experience here, as he saw the entire future of the Land of Israel unfold right before his eyes. Beginning with the Conquest of the Land, right through the period of the Judges. God showed Moses each of the judges, and the quality of leadership of each one. Then God showed him the period of the Kings, and the division of the Kingdom, right through the destruction of the Temple, and each and every happening with its respective location where it happened.

...

After God finished showing Moses the Land, He said "This is the Land which I swore to Abraham to Isaac and to Jacob saying, "I will give it to your children" I have let you see it with your own eyes .." Hashem said to Moses, "This means that you can now go to Abraham Isaac and Jacob, and tell them that I have fulfilled My promise which I made to them. The promise which was to give to their children this beautiful land as you have seen with your own eyes.

...

Now, with Moses we know that God considered his mission in life to have been accomplished once the Children of Israel reached the banks of the Jordan. Once his mission was accomplished there was no point in Moses' soul remaining in this mundane world, since it would only hinder his ascent into the spiritual world where no corporal body can gain entrance, as explained above.

# References

- Burnside, Jonathan P. Why was Moses Banned from the Promised Land? A Radical Retelling of the Rebellions of Moses, ZAR Vol. 22, 2016.
- Coats, George W. Legendary Motifs in the Moses Death Reports, Catholic Biblical Quarterly, Vol. 39, No. 1, January 1977, pages 34-44.
- Dolansky, Shawna. Deuteronomy 34: The Death of Moses, Not of Source Criticism, Journal of Biblical Literature, Vol. 133, No. 3, Fall 2014, pages 669-676.
- Erisman, Angela Roskop. Transjordan in Deuteronomy: The Promised Land and the Formation of the Pentateuch, Journal of Biblical Literature, Vol. 132, No. 4, 2013, pages 769-789.
- Erisman, Angela Roskop. Viewing the Promised Land, Moses Looks Even at the Transjordan. The Torah.com. Published Oct 17, 2019 & updated Oct 20, 2019.
- Frolov, Serge. The Death of Moses and the Fate of Source Criticism, Journal of Biblical Literature, Vol. 133, No. 3, Fall 2014, pages 648-660.
- HaCohen, David Ben-Gad. The Unknown Yet Known Place of Moses' Burial. The Torah.com. Published Oct 4, 2015 & updated Oct 10, 2019.
- Heimann, Adelheid. Moses Shown the Promised Land, Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes, Vol. 34, 1971, pages 321-324.



- Katz, Jill Citron. Moses: A Betwixt and Between Leader, The Torah.com. Published June 25, 2013 & updated Sept 23, 2019.
- Kolbrener, William. Death of Moses Revisited: Repetition and Creative Memory in Freud and the Rabbis, American Imago, Vol. 67, No. 2, Freud and the Mosaic Tradition, Summer 2010, pages 243-262.
- Kugler, Gili. Moses died and the people moved on: A hidden narrative in Deuteronomy, Journal of the Study of the Old Testament, Vol. 43, No. 2, 2019, pages 191-204.
- Kugler, Gili. Moses Dies at the Age of 120: Was it Premature? The Torah.com. Published Sept 29, 2018 & updated Oct 10, 2019.
- Mann, Thomas W. Theological Reflections on the Denial of Moses, Journal of Biblical Literature, Vol. 98, No. 4, Dec. 1979, pages 481-494.
- Strba, Blazej. Did the Israelites Realize Why Moses Had to Die? Revue Biblique, Vol. 113, No. 3, July 2006, pages 337-365.
- Wineman, Aryeh. Hasidic Myth on the Death of Moses and its Metamorphosis, Hebrew Studies, Vol. 54, 2013, pages 121-132.
- Yoo, Philip Y. The Four Moses Death Accounts, Journal of Biblical Literature, Vol. 131, No. 3, 2012, pages 423-441.